



2016

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**

Plans Review Subcommittee

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

**Thursday, April 28, 2016**

**4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,  
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701**

**1. Call to Order / Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 12:00 PM, and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Arthur Stables, Jim Sauer, Sharon Chadwick, Helen Erickson, Patsy Waterfall.

Staff: Frank Dillon, Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, Andrew Connor, Heather Thrall (PDSD);

**2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes for 4-14-16**

Motion by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 4-14-16.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 4-0 (\*Commissioners Chadwick and Waterfall arrived after vote)

**3. Trinity Presbyterian Church Preservation Boundary Amendment and Mixed Use Development:** Staff presentation, information, discussion, questions, and answers as a prelude to an upcoming formal review. No action required.

At the request of the Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS), staff Dillon presented the review process necessary for this project. Staff indicated the application is

triggered by the need for a height constraint, and applicants will return to PRS for detailed review.

**4. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

- a. **HPZ-16-04** – Change of Use: Gas Station/Jimmy Hula Restaurant – Metal Garage Door to Glass; Front Doors/windows to Glass; Landscaping and Signage – 802 N. 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue (West University)

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendation from West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB).

Presentation by business representatives, David Blair, Eric Oxman, and Jim Oaken on the proposed restaurant to serve fish tacos, burgers, and beer. According to business owner, it is a restaurant not a bar, and there are only minor modifications to the exterior of the building.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval as submitted subject to (1) retain recesses for all openings that are to be enclosed to note their prior existence; (2) signage to be considered as a separate review; and to adhere to all conditions of WUHZAB as follows:

- a. Garage Doors - Glass within metal frames
- b. Fencing - Painted steel
- c. Shade Sails and Structure - Fabric with painted steel pole structure integrated with fencing
- d. No galvalume parapet wall cladding.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

- b. **HPZ-16-26/MGD-16-01** – No Anchovies-Rear Addition/Restaurant–870 East University Boulevard, HC-1. (West University/Main Gate District)

Staff Dillon summarized the scope of the project mentioning comments from SHPO, balcony and reduced scale.

Project architects Paul De La Torres and Mark Cueva presented the background on the project. Presenters identified elements of the revised proposal from the original concept as: lower roof height, materials, contrasted existing building with dark mortar joints, architectural soldier course treatment at balconies, window sills and window/door heads,

copper standing seam metal roof and eave trim and distinguished old and new with a vertical copper metal clad wall.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to recommend approval as submitted subject to adhere to all WUHZAB conditions as follows:

- a. Window and door material on the existing historic structure to conform to wood as noted in the current West University Neighborhood Guidelines
- b. Joints of mortar washed block to be raked in lieu of flush.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

**5. Historic Landmark Review Case:**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0/Tucson Sign Code Section 3-71.G.7 and 8/3-71.D.2 Review for Compliance with HLS Cultural/Historic/Design Designation Guidelines*

**HLS-16-01** – “Casa Linda Motel” New Historic Landmark Sign (HLS): Treatment Plan, Restoration/Repair of a 43 square foot Pole Sign Cabinet-232 West Flores Road

Staff Andrew Connor for the Sign Code Division summarized the technical guidelines. This project is part of a program by the City of Tucson Historic Preservation Office to preserve signs working in partnership with willing owners. According to a review by Russlyn Wells, Acting Sign Code Administrator, the proposed Treatment Plan is in compliance with all HLS Technical Designation Guidelines (Classic – pre '61 - or Transitional – '74 and older).

The applicants, Jude Cook and Wendy Martin, seek to designate a nonconforming freestanding pole sign as a “Classic Historic Landmark Sign”; discussed all character-defining features with the Commissioners. The proposed repairs indicates the pole to remain in place, removing, restoring and re-installing the sign cabinet perpendicular to the street, with shorter cabinet end closer to the street on the off-centered pole. The sign is to remain 18.6 feet tall - top of cabinet from grade at base. Restoration involves painting cabinet body, top cut out design, and white backer outline for neon text. Neon repair: “Casa Linda” in yellow, “Motel” in aqua, and “No Vacancy” text in white neon is proposed

Staff recommends “NO VACANCY” be excluded from defining text, as it is not in a prominent area of the sign and to allow for potential adaptive re-use of this portion of the sign by future tenants under a separate treatment plan review process. Subcommittee discussed keeping the metal cover on the sign that is used to cover the “No” in “No Vacancy”. Additionally, that if colors discovered during restoration were significantly different, return to PRS for review.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend approval of the Treatment Plan as presented, noting the following- character-defining features:

- the "art-deco" shape of the sign, including the zig-zags at the bottom and the building shape at the top
- the painting of the building at the top of the sign
- the custom font used for "Casa Linda"
- the custom font used for "Motel"
- the asymmetrical position of the sign on the pole
- the colors of the paint and the colors of the neon as proposed, or as discovered during restoration

The character defining text of the sign to be:

- "Casa Linda" and "Motel"

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

## **6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

### **a. Minor Reviews**

Staff Taku will conduct reviews with Commissioner Stables.

### **b. Appeals**

None at this time

### **c. Zoning Violations**

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations in the City Historic Districts and Rio Nuevo Area.

### **d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects**

#### **Draft revisions to the Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings**

Subcommittee discussed and is generally supportive of reasonable changes; suggests review for clarity of language; noted new section on climate change and hazards; sustainability; appreciates wider consideration on window options; flexibility on material use; clarity on interior spaces (p.43); work

needed on masonry section and questions where is the mechanical is found in the Guidelines.

Commissioner Erickson motioned, seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to empower Chair Majewski to send review comments on behalf of the PRS

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

**7. Call to the Audience (For Information Only)**

Val Little speaking as a citizen urged PRS to give a lot of thought on the impact on West University Historic District and the potential of a precedent in its review of the Trinity Church proposal.

**8. Future Agenda Items**

Parish Hall-Revised Replacement Plan  
Trinity Presbyterian Church Preservation Boundary and Mixed Use  
Development. Single Family Residences (Barrio and Armory Park)

**9. Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:02 PM.